Librarian Employment Regulations at McGill University: An Overview

ACALP Town Hall Presentation
May 4, 2016

Marc Richard
Associate Librarian
McGill University

Outline

• Part 1
  Employment regulations for McGill librarians:
  What they are and how they’re governed

• Questions

• Part 2
  Employment regulations for McGill librarians:
  How to change them and how they’ve changed

• Questions

Librarians at McGill University have been members of the academic staff since 1974
Like McGill professors, McGill librarians:

- Are not unionized
- Are represented by the McGill Association of University Teachers (MAUT)

The McGill Association of University Teachers (MAUT)

- Is a non-certified association
- Does not have mandatory membership (the Rand formula does not apply)
- Has a Librarians' Section (MAUT-LS) (in which membership is not mandatory)

The McGill Association of University Teachers (MAUT)

- “Advises, consults, discusses and reaches agreements” with the University Administration on a variety of subjects
- Does not “negotiate” (in the sense defined by the Quebec Labour Code, meaning the negotiation and application of collective agreements)

Like McGill professors, McGill librarians:

- Have personal ranks:
  - Assistant Librarian
  - Associate Librarian
  - Full Librarian
- Are eligible...
  - for tenure
  - for sabbatical leave
  - for service on academic staff seats on governance bodies
Like McGill professors, McGill librarians:

- Are covered by most of the same academic employment regulations and policies
- Have three categories of academic duties
- Require a performance assessment of “two superiors and one reasonable” to get tenure

**However**, there are some important differences in these last two points....

### 3 Categories of Academic Duties

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Professors</strong></th>
<th><strong>Librarians</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teaching</td>
<td>“Position responsibilities” (as a librarian)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research</td>
<td>“Professional and scholarly activities, which may include research”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other contributions (service to the</td>
<td>Other contributions (service to the University &amp; scholarly communities)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University &amp; scholarly communities)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Professors**

- Teaching
- Research
- Other contributions (service to the University & scholarly communities)

**Librarians**

- “Position responsibilities” (as a librarian)
- Other contributions (service to the University & scholarly communities)

The specific librarian job that someone has within the McGill Libraries
### 3 Categories of Academic Duties

**Professors**
- Teaching
- Research
- Other contributions (service to the University & scholarly communities)

**Librarians**
- “Professional and scholarly activities, which may include research”
- Publications & presentations (scholarly and/or serving the librarian profession)

**Professors**
- Teaching
- Research
- Other contributions (service to the University & scholarly communities)

**Librarians**
- Committee service and/or elected positions, either within McGill or outside (locally, nationally or internationally)
- Other contributions (service to the University & scholarly communities)

---

### Performance Requirements for Tenure

**Professors**
- Teaching
- Research
- Other contributions (service to the University and scholarly communities)

Minimum requirement: 2 superiors & at least 1 reasonable, in any combination of categories

**Librarians**
- “Position responsibilities” (as a librarian)
- “Professional and scholarly activities” (which may include research)
- Other contributions (service to the University and scholarly communities)

Minimum requirement: mandatory superior in first category, + 1 superior & at least 1 reasonable in the remaining two categories
Tenure Criteria

3.10 The Library Tenure Committee and the University Tenure Committee, hereinafter provided for, and the Principal or delegate shall base their recommendations on the candidate’s performance of academic duties as defined in Section 1.2.2. Superior performance in position responsibilities, the first category set out in Section 1.2.2, which is the most important of the academic duties, is required and a superior performance in one of the remaining two categories and a reasonable performance in the other shall be the minimum requirement for the granting of tenure.
What kinds of amendments have been made to the librarian employment regulations over the years?

To understand the answer, one first has to know a few basics about:

- where these regulations fit in relation to other governance and administrative instruments
- the collegial processes (written and unwritten) through which regulations are amended

Important to remember:

Employment conditions for McGill librarians are prescribed by a large collection of governance and administrative instruments, not by a single document
Hierarchy of Governance and Administrative Instruments

Statutes
Regulations
Policies
Procedures
Guidelines

• Different scope
• Different levels of formality
• Different approval mechanisms: some require governance approval (Board of Governors, Senate, faculty councils, etc.); others are under the purview of the Administration (Principal, Deans, etc.)

"Rarely" does not mean "Never"
An interesting example of this principle:

Two librarian employment Guidelines (Reappointment Criteria Guidelines and Tenure Criteria Guidelines) were developed and approved by the Library Council, a formal collegial governance body comprising all the librarians on staff

Always Sometimes Rarely

Is governance approval required for these instruments to be created or amended?
Hierarchy of Governance and Administrative Instruments

- Statutes
- Regulations
- Policies
  - Procedures
  - Guidelines

- Separate but interrelated instruments

What are some examples of the subjects covered by these instruments?

- Separate but interrelated instruments
- Each one can be amended independently
- Amending one may require amending others
Examples of Subjects Governed by the Statutes

- Allocate 3 elected Senate seats to librarians (plus an ex officio seat for the Dean of Libraries)
- Define 3 elected academic staff members-at-large Senate seats (for which librarians are eligible)
- Appointments of Full Professors / Full Librarians (covers certain procedural aspects of promotions or initial appointments made to these ranks)

Examples of Regulations for Academic Staff
(titles edited for clarity)

- General employment conditions of professors
- General employment conditions of librarians “Regulations Relating to the Employment of Librarian Staff”
- Sabbatical leaves
- Maternity and parental leaves
- Conduct of research
- Retirement of academic staff (also covers Emeritus / Emerita designations for retired Full Professors and Full Librarians)

Examples of Policies
(titles edited for clarity)

- Academicsalary policy (annual) (governs the salary increase components: across-the-board + merit + retention / salary anomaly envelope)
- Employment equity policy
Examples of Procedures and Guidelines  
(titles edited for clarity)

Procedure:
- Vacation entitlement for academic staff

Guideline:
- Implementation of academic salary policy (annual)

Outline

- Part 1
  Employment regulations for McGill librarians: What they are and how they’re governed

- Questions

- Part 2
  Employment regulations for McGill librarians: How to change them and how they’ve changed

- Questions

What kinds of amendments have been made to the librarian employment regulations over the years?

To understand the answer, one first has to know a few basics about:
- where these regulations fit in relation to other governance and administrative instruments
- the collegial processes (written and unwritten) through which regulations are amended
What kinds of amendments have been made to the librarian employment regulations over the years?

A Note on Terminology

- For convenience, the presentation will focus only on how to amend existing regulations
- Similar principles apply to creating new regulations
- Similar principles apply to creating and/or amending other instruments (such as policies)

How Amendment Proposals Arise

- Usually originate from the University Administration
- Sometimes (though rarely) originate elsewhere (such as the McGill Association of University Teachers [MAUT])
- Proposals can arise at any time (since they don’t involve a collective agreement with a fixed duration)
- The proposals are usually guided through the required steps by the Associate Provost (Policies, Procedures & Equity)

Where Proposals Go & How They Get There

- Amendments to regulations require governance approval from Senate, then the Board of Governors
- Before they reach Senate, however, they must go through a consultation process with stakeholders
- By unwritten convention, MAUT is always consulted about proposed regulation changes
- For major amendments to the librarian employment regulations, the MAUT Librarians’ Section is usually consulted as well (but not for relatively minor changes)
“Consultation” Does Not Equal “Approval”

- Strictly speaking, MAUT does not have any approval or veto rights over proposed regulation changes.
- That being said, proposals are often revised during the consultation process between MAUT and the Administration; the aim is to agree on a final draft.
- Some proposals get withdrawn entirely as a result.
- A (more or less) satisfactory draft is usually agreed to, but unresolved points may have to be argued in Senate by academic Senators (MAUT has no Senate seat).

The MAUT Process for Formal Consultations

- The convention that MAUT is always consulted about proposed regulation changes is more of an established practice than an explicit written requirement, at least as far what is prescribed by the governance instruments themselves.
- MAUT has its own internal By-Law on how a formal consultation of MAUT can be carried out...
The MAUT Process for Formal Consultations

...but it simply defines the process which the Administration must follow in order to claim that it has consulted MAUT about something.

- The MAUT consultation process:
  - Cannot force the Administration to consult MAUT
  - Does not oblige the Administration to take MAUT’s advice when it does consult MAUT

What kinds of amendments have been made to the librarian employment regulations over the years?

Many types, grouped here as follows:

- General categories of amendments
- Some librarian-specific amendments

For the sake of brevity, most of the slides will deal with broad types of amendments, not with individual examples or with their actual text.
General Categories of Amendments

“Substantive” Amendments
- Changes which have a definite practical impact on academic employment conditions

Example: November 2014 amendment to the Regulations on Sabbatic Leaves for Tenure Track and Tenured Academic Staff

7.3.1 To the extent that income tax regulations allow, staff members may request that a portion of their salary be made available as a research grant rather than salary during the period of sabbatical leave. In this case, the staff member’s salary shall be reduced by the amount of the research grant and all contributory costs of benefits, paid by the staff member and the University, shall be pro-rated accordingly.

“Synchronization” Amendments
- Wording changes made to one set of regulations may require making parallel changes to related regulations
- Often required for this pair of regulations:
  - Regulations Relating to the Employment of Academic Staff (specific to professors)
  - Regulations Relating to the Employment of Librarian Staff (specific to librarians)

“Housekeeping” Amendments
- Wording changes which do not affect the substance of the text
- Purpose: simplify or improve clarity of the text; replace or remove obsolete terminology; make minor technical corrections
- Sometimes prompted by the realization that a particular article has proved problematic to apply under its current formulation
General Categories of Amendments

“Extract and Merge” Amendments

Identical specialized parts of the Regulations Relating to the Employment of Academic Staff and of the Regulations Relating to the Employment of Librarian Staff are sometimes taken out of these separate documents and merged to create a new freestanding regulation document applying to both professors and librarians.

Example: (February 2015)

Regulations Relating to the Employment of Academic Staff
Section 8

Regulations Relating to the Employment of Librarian Staff
Section 7

Regulations on Appeals of Tenure Decisions (new document applying to both professors and librarians)
General Categories of Amendments

Amendments Arising from Staff Grievances or Disciplinary Cases
- When the Committee on Staff Grievances and Disciplinary Procedures rules on a case, it may make recommendations on amending the regulations
- These recommendations tend to relate to:
  ● Aspects of the regulations which the CSGDP found to be worded ambiguously or otherwise problematic
  ● Elements of the regulations which should perhaps be revised to prevent similar cases from arising in the future

Amendments Driven by External Events
- Rare, but they do happen
- Most typical cases: amendments made to the conduct-of-research regulations to reflect rule changes implemented by the three federal granting councils
- Less frequently: amendments made to reflect changes in labour law or other legislation

Some Librarian-Specific Amendments

The examples given will cover three topics...
  ● Personal Ranks
  ● Reappointment, Promotion and Tenure
  ● Academic Duties

...and will limit themselves to a few basic elements
(leaving out many arcane details and complications)
A Note on Terminology

- The “Blue Book” and the “Grey Books” mentioned in the following slides were the binders and booklets in which the employment regulations and related documents used to be published.
- All these documents are now issued and updated online by the University Secretariat.

### Personal Ranks

**1985 Blue Book**
- Junior Librarian
- Assistant Librarian
- Associate Librarian
- Senior Librarian
  (+ unranked Non-Tenure-Stream)

**1985 Blue Book**
- Junior Librarian
- Assistant Librarian
- Associate Librarian
- Senior Librarian
  (+ unranked Non-Tenure-Stream)

**1989 Grey Book**
- Assistant Librarian
- Associate Librarian
- Librarian
  (ranks for everyone; NTS concept remains, but ≠ having no rank)
### Personal Ranks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Roles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1985 Blue Book</td>
<td>- Junior Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Assistant Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Associate Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Senior Librarian (+ unranked Non-Tenure-Stream)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989 Grey Book</td>
<td>- Assistant Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Associate Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Librarian (ranks for everyone; NTS concept remains, but ≠ having no rank)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998 Grey Book</td>
<td>- Assistant Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Associate Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Librarian (Sessional Librarian (NTS concept is now expressed as a rank)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985 Blue Book</td>
<td>- Junior Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Assistant Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Associate Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Senior Librarian (+ unranked Non-Tenure-Stream)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989 Grey Book</td>
<td>- Assistant Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Associate Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Sessional Librarian (NTS concept remains, but ≠ having no rank)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998 Grey Book</td>
<td>- Assistant Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Associate Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Sessional Librarian (NTS concept is now expressed as a rank)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Personal Ranks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Roles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1985 Blue Book</td>
<td>- Junior Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Assistant Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Associate Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Senior Librarian (+ unranked Non-Tenure-Stream)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989 Grey Book</td>
<td>- Assistant Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Associate Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Librarian (ranks for everyone; NTS concept remains, but ≠ having no rank)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998 Grey Book</td>
<td>- Assistant Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Associate Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Librarian (Sessional Librarian (NTS concept is now expressed as a rank)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002 Grey Book</td>
<td>- Assistant Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Associate Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Full Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Sessional Librarian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current Regulations (2007 &amp; onward)</td>
<td>- Assistant Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Associate Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Full Librarian&lt;br&gt;- Sessional Librarian (all librarians continue to have a personal rank; Non-Tenure-Stream status still exists, but as a separate concept expressed via other language)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Reappointment, Promotion and Tenure

- Under the 1985 Blue Book, tenure for librarians was called “Senior Professional Appointment” (SPA)

- Since the 1989 Grey Book, it’s been called tenure

---

Reappointment, Promotion and Tenure

- Under the 1985 Blue Book, tenure for librarians was called “Senior Professional Appointment” (SPA)

- Since the 1989 Grey Book, it’s been called tenure

- Under the 1985 Blue Book, promotion to the rank of Associate Librarian was a separate process from the granting of an SPA

- Since the 1989 Grey Book, a grant of tenure confers an automatic promotion to Associate Librarian rank
Reappointment, Promotion and Tenure

- Criteria and processes for reappointment, promotion and tenure have evolved; currently much clearer and more detailed than used to be the case.

- These two previously mentioned documents...
  - Guidelines on Criteria for Reappointment for Tenure-Track Librarian Staff (7 pages long)
  - Guidelines on Criteria for Tenure Consideration for Tenure-Track Librarian Staff (6 pages long)

...which were adopted by Library Council in 2012 are good examples of this more detailed approach.
Reappointment, Promotion and Tenure

- The basis for reappointment ("satisfactory promise of and progress towards meeting the tenure criteria") and the previously-mentioned criteria for tenure ("two superiors and one reasonable") are specified in the Regulations Relating to the Employment of Librarian Staff.
- The two Guidelines on Criteria documents do not override the Regulations (which have a higher status); they provide interpretational guidance to members of reappointment and tenure committees.

The Three Areas of Librarian Academic Duties

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2002 Grey Book</td>
<td>Current Regulations (2007 &amp; onward)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2002 Grey Book</td>
<td>Current Regulations (2007 &amp; onward)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Three Areas of Librarian Academic Duties

1985 Blue Book
- Work performance
- Professional development
- Research

- Work performance
- Contributions to the University
- Contributions to librarianship/scholarship

2002 Grey Book
Current Regulations (2007 & onward)
- Position responsibilities
- Research and other original scholarly activities, and professional activities
- Other contributions to the University and scholarly communities

The Three Areas of Librarian Academic Duties

1985 Blue Book
- Work performance
- Professional development
- Research

- Work performance
- Contributions to the University
- Contributions to librarianship/scholarship

2002 Grey Book
Current Regulations (2007 & onward)
- Position responsibilities
- Research and other original scholarly activities, and professional activities
- Other contributions to the University and scholarly communities

Since their adoption in 2012, the two Guidelines on Criteria documents...

...have helped librarians and reappointment/tenure committee members to interpret what activities fall under which category of librarian academic duties.
### The Three Areas of Librarian Academic Duties

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Academic Duty</th>
<th>Examples</th>
<th>Evidence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>I. Position responsibilities</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching, learning, and research support (including reference and information literacy services)</td>
<td>• Describe strategies (committees, meetings, e-mails, personal contacts, etc.) for fulfilling liaison role with academic departments or clientele &lt;br&gt; • Include representative evidence (letters, evaluation forms, etc.) of excellent service to academic departments and/or primary clientele &lt;br&gt; • Provide list of course names and numbers of seminar/class presentations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collection development or curision</td>
<td>• Briefly describe overall activities. Include dates and metrical data where applicable</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>II. Professional and scholarly activities</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>II.a. Publications</strong></td>
<td><strong>Monographs</strong></td>
<td>• Provide citation and link to electronic version or catalogue record &lt;br&gt; • State impact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Juried Publications</strong></td>
<td>Published articles, chapters in peer-reviewed journals or books, and juried conference proceedings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Invited Publications</strong></td>
<td>• Provide citation (with stable URL if applicable) and pdf copies &lt;br&gt; • State impact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Non-Juried Journal Articles, Book Chapters, Proceedings, and Essays</strong></td>
<td>• Provide citation (with stable URL if applicable) and pdf copies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### The Three Areas of Librarian Academic Duties

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>III. Other contributions to the university and scholarly communities</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Editorships</strong></td>
<td>Editor or member of an editorial board of a journal</td>
<td>• List periodical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>International and National Committees</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Describe committee mandate, where appropriate &lt;br&gt; • Describe overall contribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Provincial and Regional Committees</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Describe committee mandate, where appropriate &lt;br&gt; • Describe overall contribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>University or Affiliated Committees and Elected Offices</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Describe overall contribution</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**End of Part 2**