ATTENDANCE: As recorded in the Faculty Appendix Book

DOCUMENTS: S-15-17 to S-15-23

On behalf of Dean Bruce Lennox, Associate Dean (Academic) Tamara Western Chaired the meeting. The meeting began at 3:00 p.m.

1) ADOPTION OF AGENDA

An additional item to be added under Dean's Business, #6 (b), first student graduating with a B.Sc. Global Designation.

Prof. Gyakum moved, seconded by Prof. Mucci, that the amended Agenda be approved.

The motion carried.

2) CANDIDATES FOR DEGREES

a) Bachelor of Arts and Science S-15-18

b) Bachelor of Science S-15-19

602.1 Director (Advising Services) Nicole Allard said that for the B.A. & Sc. degree, there were 32 candidates, up by 4 from the previous year, and for the B.Sc. degree, there were 132, up by 1 from the previous year.

Director Allard moved, seconded by Prof. Grütter, that the candidates for the B.A. & Sc. and the B.Sc. be approved for their respective degrees.

The motion carried.

602.2 Director Allard thanked departmental and Faculty advisors for their hard work in putting together the degree lists. If anyone had any questions or queries, they should contact Peter Barry, Chief Academic Advisor, or herself.

c) Diploma in Environment S-15-20

d) Diploma in Meteorology S-15-21

602.3 There were no candidates for the Diplomas in Environment and Meteorology.

Prof. Bell further moved, seconded by Prof. Grütter, that the Dean be given discretionary power to make such changes as would be necessary to prevent injustice.

The motion carried.

3) MINUTES OF 12 JANUARY 2016 S-15-17

Prof. Gyakum moved, seconded by Prof. Grütter, that the Minutes be approved.
The motion carried.

4) BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

There was no business arising from the Minutes.

5) REPORTS OF COMMITTEES

- Academic Committee  S-15-22

The Academic Committee approved the following on Tuesday, 19 January 2016:

SECTION A: COURSE REVISIONS

(1)  ANATOMY & CELL BIOLOGY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Credits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ANAT 182</td>
<td>Astrobiology</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Course Retirement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

605.1  Associate Dean Western explained that ANAT 182 was a double-prefix course with EPSC 182. This had arisen because the instructor had originally been cross-appointed to the Departments of Anatomy & Cell Biology, and Earth & Planetary Sciences. Since the instructor is no longer cross-appointed, and since Astrobiology does not fit with the rest of the offerings of the Department of Anatomy & Cell Biology, the Department would like to retire the course. EPSC 182 is not being retired.

Director Allard moved, seconded by Prof. Grütter, that the course be retired.

The motion carried.

(2)  GEOGRAPHY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Credits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GEOG 420</td>
<td>Memory, Place, and Power</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Changes: schedule type, prerequisites</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

605.2  Associate Dean Western said that GEOG 420 was being changed from a seminar to a lecture course in order to increase enrolment, and to coordinate it with the cross-listed POLI 432. Additionally, the choice of prerequisites was being increased.

Director Allard moved, seconded by Prof. Roulet, that the changes be approved.

The motion carried.

(3)  PHARMACOLOGY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Credits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PHAR 301</td>
<td>Drugs and Disease</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Change in prerequisites</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

605.3  Associate Dean Western said that "permission of instructor" was being removed from the prerequisites in order to ensure that students taking PHAR 301 have previously taken PHAR 300.

Director Allard moved, seconded by Prof. Grütter, that the changes be approved.

The motion carried.
605.4 Associate Dean Western said that the course description for PHYS 181 had been updated to reflect the current course content. Also, the restriction on PHYS 202 was being removed since it was no longer offered.

Director Allard moved, seconded by Prof. Grütter, that the changes be approved.

The motion carried.

SECTION B: PROGRAM CHANGES:

(1) PSYCHOLOGY
Ph.D. in Psychology; Language Acquisition Option
Ph.D. in Psychology

605.5 Associate Dean Western explained that the Language Acquisition Option was a collaboration across four departments and Faculties: Psychology, Communication Sciences and Disorders, Integrated Studies in Education, and Linguistics. The requirements for the Language Acquisition Option were currently too onerous when taken in addition to the Ph.D. requirements. The requirements for the Language Acquisition Option were consequently being reduced by five credits. Additionally, the list of Complementary Courses was being slightly modified. All four departments have agreed to the changes, and are submitting proposals concurrently.

605.6 Additionally, the format of the Ph.D. in Psychology was being updated for clarity and to bring it in line with the current eCalendar norms.

Director Allard moved, seconded by Prof. Nader, that the above changes be approved.

The motion carried.

(2) MINOR IN INTERDISCIPLINARY LIFE SCIENCES

605.7 Associate Dean Western said that the current Minor contains a statement regarding overlapping credits between programs. The Minor in Interdisciplinary Life Sciences is the only Science Minor containing such a statement. However, the statement is redundant since overlapping credits are covered by a Faculty regulation. Furthermore, the statement is confusing to B.A. & Sc. students since they are not allowed to overlap any credits between programs.

Director Allard moved, seconded by Prof. Mucci, that the changes be approved.

The motion carried.

SECTION C: OTHER (For Information Only)

- Consideration of Courses And Programs For Calendar Inclusion

605.8 Associate Dean Western reminded members that the present time was appropriate to start thinking about new courses and programs, and course and program changes, to allow plenty of time for consultation, etc., before submission for approval in the Fall for the eCalendar.
6) **DEAN’S BUSINESS**

a) Dean's Multidisciplinary Undergraduate Research List (DMURL)  S-15-23

606.1 Director Allard reminded members that the DMURL recognizes students with at least 9 credits of graded research-based courses in at least two different units. A minimum GPA of 3.00 on these courses is required. The DMURL is added at graduation for B.Sc. and B.A. & Sc. students. There were five B.Sc. students and three B.A. & Sc. students on the DMURL. The combinations of research courses were interesting, and in some cases, students went well beyond the minimum requirements.

b) B.Sc. Global Designation

606.2 Director Allard said that the B.Sc. Global Designation was a new distinction being given at graduation. Students must have at least three credits of a second language course, at least three credits of an independent research project course, plus a third component, chosen from various preselected options. The first student to graduate with the B.Sc. Global Designation completed her degree in the Department of Geography, and is included in the B.Sc. degree list above, Document S-15-19.

c) Announcements

606.3 Associate Dean Western made the following announcements on behalf of Dean Lennox, who was in Ottawa attending the Herzberg Award Ceremony for Prof. Victoria Kaspi (see below). She congratulated her colleagues on their accomplishments.

**Herzberg Medal & Grant**

606.4 **Professor Victoria Kaspi** of the Department of Physics has been awarded NSERC’s 2016 Gerhard Herzberg Canada Gold Medal for Science and Engineering for her research on Neutron Stars. This is NSERC’s highest honour and carries with it a grant of up to $1M. Prof. Kaspi is one of the youngest researchers and the first woman to ever win this prestigious medal.

**Gilles Brassard Prize**

606.5 **Yasser Gidi**, a graduate student in the Department of Chemistry (supervisor: Prof. Gonzalo Cosa) has been awarded the NSERC Gilles Brassard Doctoral Prize for Interdisciplinary Research.

**New Canada Research Chair Recipients**

606.6 **Aashish Clerk**, Professor, Department of Physics – Tier 1
Canada Research Chair in Theory of Engineered Quantum Systems.

606.7 **Natalya Gomez**, Assistant Professor, Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences – Tier 2
Canada Research Chair in the Geodynamics of Ice Sheet - Sea Level Interactions.

606.8 **Irene Gregory Eaves**, Associate Professor – Tier 2
Canada Research Chair in Freshwater Ecology and Global Change.

606.9 **Timothy Merlis**, Assistant Professor in Atmospheric and Oceanic Sciences – Tier 2
Canada Research Chair in Atmospheric and Climate Dynamics.

606.10 **Nancy Ross**, Professor, Department of Geography – Tier 1
Canada Research Chair in Geo-Social Determinants of Health.
Renewal of Canada Research Chair
606.11 Jeffrey Mogil, Professor, Department of Psychology – Tier 1
Canada Research Chair in Genetics of Pain.

Principal's Task Force on the Academic Vision and Mission of the RVH Site
606.12 The Task Force had requested Expressions of Interests regarding the RVH site. Dean Lennox had received seven submissions, and had endorsed and submitted them to the Task Force. Associate Dean Western, on behalf of Dean Lennox, expressed thanks to those who had made submissions.

7) REPORTS OF DIRECTOR AND ASSOCIATE DEANS

a) Director (Advising Services) Nicole Allard

Director Allard had already reported on the B.Sc. and B.A. & Sc. degree lists, the DMURL and the B.Sc. Global Designation.

b) Associate Dean (Graduate Education) Laura Nilson

Associate Dean Nilson said that:

607.1 - there were new immigration procedures for postdoctoral fellows and graduate research trainees. There will be an information session for graduate program coordinators on 19 February 2016.

607.2 - she is currently working on graduate-student funding allocations, had already met with some units, and should have preliminary figures in a week or so. She added that money is given to the Faculty by the Office of Graduate & Postdoctoral Students, and is then distributed to units. Members could obtain more information from departmental graduate-program directors.

607.3 - she had attended a meeting the previous day of the Graduate Advisory Council, which is headed by the Dean of GPS and consists of the associate deans from all the faculties. The subject of the meeting was the unionization of postdoctoral fellows. Mr. Robert Comeau, Director, Labour and Employee Relations, Human Resources, who was leading the development of a collective agreement, was at the meeting to inform people about where things stand, and to get input about the kinds of issues regarding postdoctoral fellows that he should keep in mind when negotiating the collective agreement. The Québec Labour Board had ruled that postdoctoral fellows were employees and hence could unionize, and now McGill is setting up to start working on the collective agreement. It would normally take a year or two from the start of negotiations to having a collective agreement in place. Another consequence of the Labour Board's ruling was that postdoctoral fellows would now be subject to provincial tax. McGill is working on setting up the accounting to allow for this, and information will be sent out to units in the near future. The Graduate Advisory Council had given Mr. Comeau a good deal of information to keep in mind about postdoctoral fellows. Associate Dean Nilson said that members could contact her if they would like to pass on anything to Mr. Comeau, or if they would like further information.

c) Associate Dean (Research) Doina Precup

607.4 Associate Dean Precup said that CFI application processes are rolling, and that there will be a meeting on Thursday, 18 February 2016, of associate deans to present their faculty's synopsis. If there are updates from members, they could send them to her. Aside from that, there was nothing new to report.

d) Associate Dean (Academic) Tamara Western
Associate Dean Western said that she had no further report beyond the Academic Committee report.

8) REPORTS ON ACTIONS OF SENATE

- Senate Meeting of 2 December 2015 – Prof. Masad Damha

The Senate meeting started with some remarks from our Principal. She spoke about her attendance at the Royal Society of Canada’s (“RSC”) Annual General Meeting, in Victoria, BC. She shared that McGill was well represented during the Induction and Awards Ceremony which welcomes new Fellows into the Royal Society of Canada. She noted that Professor Graham Bell recently completed his two-year term as President of the RSC and took this opportunity to thank him for his service. (Thank you Graham!)

The Principal also shared the news that the McGill Office for Science & Society was awarded the 2015 Science Promotion Prize by the Canadian Council of University Biology Chairs in recognition of its contribution to the promotion of biology in Canada. The Prize was accepted by Prof. David Harpp on behalf of the OSS at the CCUBC annual meeting in November.

-----

On the topic of deteriorating buildings on our campus, the Principal described a plan to address some of McGill’s deferred maintenance problems. The plan was being developed by the Administration and the Board of Governors and take advantage of the currently low interest rates. During question period, Senator Di Grappa indicated that the plan has been approved by the Quebec government, and involves bonds issues totaling $400M, with the loan period extending over 40 years, in four equal phases of roughly $100 million dollars each, beginning this term. A list of projects was submitted to the provincial government and approximately $200 million has already been approved in support of these projects. Senator Di Grappa also explained that a working list has been prepared after assessing the condition of the various buildings, and that McGill will have flexibility with respect to which projects will be dealt with first.

-----

During the question period, various Senators posed several questions on management and/or ownership of companies by McGill University professors.

Questions centered on professors at McGill University receiving monetary incentives for their work in consulting, managing and/or owning companies, # of graduate students completing their research within such companies, and what current regulations, if any, provide protections to students when conflicts of interest exist.

Dean Nalbantoglu and VP Goldstein indicated that there is no regulation preventing students from working anywhere, including for corporations in which their supervisor has an interest, pointing out such employment often provides valuable professional experience to students. However, they noted that such situations need to be managed, that Regulations at McGill exist to do just this, such as the Regulations on Conflict of Interest, Research Misconduct, and Conduct of Research, also pointing out that other policy frameworks exists like those provided by the Tri-Council Granting Agencies.

Senator Nystrom referred to a case reported in the McGill Tribune, about the student whose Master’s thesis was ordered to be destroyed. He added that this case raises a number of issues that need to be addressed, given that McGill is a public institution receiving public funds for public research.
Senator Dudek cautioned against jumping to conclusions. He also noted that there is already a requirement to report conflicts and potential conflicts as well as an annual review regarding research misconduct. He therefore expressed that it is unnecessary to add more reporting requirements to those already present.

---

Following these discussions, Principal Fortier stepped out of the Chair for the next agenda item, which was an Open Discussion on the subject of Research Funding and Support.

My summary here is largely derived from excerpts we received from our Librarian Senate representatives, Senators Gore, Richard and Waters.

A few Senators expressed discouragement at the response of the U15 (the Group of 15 Canadian Research Universities) to problems related to funding and felt that McGill should be leading the discussion on this issue. Principal Fortier commented that, to her knowledge, the U15 group has been very active in promoting funding (for example, in relation to the granting councils and to the indirect costs of research).

Senator Bernard asked whether McGill was prepared to take a position on the current leadership at CIHR and on the recent reforms made to its funding scheme.

Principal Fortier responded that the problems arising from the new funding scheme have been documented and that there has been a meeting with the President of CIHR. She indicated that the new funding scheme is a pilot; it has problems, but steps are being taken to address and remedy the issues that were noted in the first round of grants. She added that complaining was not the best strategy, that we need to give CIHR a chance to fix the problems before we take a more drastic position, or start campaigning against the current leadership of CIHR.

Several interventions by Senators addressed the issue of targeted research and curiosity-driven research. There were questions such as “If targeted research is often described as “useful research”, does it mean that curiosity-driven research is “useless research”? To this issue, a Senator asked whether the University is prepared to recommend a percentage of funding that should be directed to investigator-driven research versus targeted research. The Principal responded that it is a question of balance, and that such a balance actually favours curiosity-driven research.

Senator Galaty commented that the trend towards small numbers of large grants and away from large numbers of small ones, combined with the growing number of researchers, has created a funding crisis in which people are being crowded out.

Senator Robaire agreed that we cannot keep increasing the number of grant applicants without increasing the funding base, and added that the government needs to recognize this.

In response to this, the Principal expressed the view that there is a deteriorating environment in Canada rather than a crisis, particularly because the total level of funding has not increased with inflation and the Canadian dollar has lost some purchasing value. However, she indicated that most people agree that there seems to be a crisis in the biomedical research area, both in Canada and the United States.

Senator Mucci raised concerns about the "star system" which allocates large amounts of money to a small number of researchers. Principal Fortier responded that, whether we like it or not, we do not live in a vacuum and we are in an international competition for talent. She recognizes that grants are a stressful element for faculty members.
One final topic was that of mentoring new faculty members. Senator Robaire remarked that McGill should consider a mandatory mentoring system particularly in those departments or faculties where no such system presently exists. This will help pre-tenure faculty navigate the rough waters of the grant process, for example. Finally, Senator Robaire suggested that we should diversify graduate education to prepare students for careers other than in research.

As the final agenda item, Senate moved into confidential session to discuss the report of the Honorary Degrees and Convocations Committee.

- Senate Meeting of 13 January 2016 - Prof. Timothy Moore

Senate opened with a moving tribute to Chancellor Emeritus Arnold Steinberg, who has been a valued supporter of McGill since he started his B. Com program in 1950. He served as Chancellor from 2009 to 2014, worked tirelessly and effectively behind the scenes and died on December 11 at the age of 82.

The issue of conflicts of interest between a professor's supervisory obligations to a student and the professor's private commercial interests was raised and Dean Nalbantoglu reported that problems of this nature are quite rare; one out of every 600 cases. It was suggested that the annual tracking forms, signed by student, supervisor and graduate program director will be modified by the addition of a summary of the definition of conflicts of interest, a link to the relevant web pages, and a box that will need to be checked off. More paperwork required at the lower level to address issues pertinent to only a few.

In addition to kudos, Principal Fortier reported work on the feasibility study has begun on the former Royal Victoria Hospital site, with invitations to those who might wish to move into the site to submit expressions of interest by mid-February. The Principal expressed her thanks to the McGill community for its contributions to the most recent Centraide campaign, which surpassed the $500,000 fundraising mark.

The sole question came from student Senators and raised the issue of McGill divesting from fossil fuels. The response was that the issue was being discussed by the Board of Governors Committee to Advise on Matters of Social Responsibility and a report will be issue by the end of March. In response to a follow-up question, it was noted that McGill little research funding came from fossil fuel companies and that several initiatives have been taken to support sustainability education and research at McGill.

The Academic Policy Committee report contained revisions to the Regulations Concerning the Investigation of Research Misconduct, which were accepted. A proposal for the establishment of the McGill University Research Centre on Complex Traits raised the question that the opaque title was very different from the French one, ‘Centre de recherche de l'Université McGill sur les maladies infectieuses et inflammatoires chroniques’. V.-P. Goldstein responded that in the English version of the name the descriptive elements were treated as a subtitle (An Initiative to Cure Infectious and Chronic Inflammatory Diseases) and it was recommended that this integration occur in the English name.

V.-P. Goldstein presented the Annual Report on Research Performance and Innovation, containing a wealth of quantitative information on grant funding. A new administrator Associate Vice-Principal, Innovation and Partnerships will be appointed, though it was claimed that this is not really a new position and overall, the number of management positions will decrease. A wealth of information, but perhaps not knowledge, was presented on research funding to McGill, in comparison with other universities. In terms
of ‘research intensity’ (really $$ funding per professor, as defined by each university, which varies), McGill ranked first in SSHRC, 2nd in NSERC (both central to the Faculty of Science) and 4th in CIHR, which elicited questions on why Medicine was performing so poorly, to which there was no clear answer. There was also a question about not only financial metrics (gross amount, amount per person) but also how effectively the funds were used – what ‘bang for the buck’ does one get?

The somewhat jargon-laden Annual Report on Student Life and Learning was presented by Deputy Provost Dyens, listing the various activities of this large and diverse unit and in discussion identifying some of the challenges that will be faced at McGill in the coming years, and the ways in which the success of initiatives could be assessed.

9) **MEMBERS’ QUESTION PERIOD**

There were no members’ questions.

10) **OTHER BUSINESS**

Prof. Damha moved, seconded by Prof. Lydon, that the meeting be adjourned at 3:45 p.m.

The motion carried.