

# Tenure policies and procedures

Lydia White  
Associate Provost  
(Policies, Procedures & Equity)



Oct. 2014



# Context

- The aim of this session is to clarify tenure procedures at McGill, particularly for those of you being considered in 2015-16.
- Much of what we will be discussing is contained within the *Regulations Relating to the Employment of Tenure Track and Tenured Academic Staff* and the *Regulations Relating to the Employment of Librarian Staff*, available at:  
<http://www.mcgill.ca/secretariat/policies/academic/>



# Year of consideration

Mandatory tenure consideration (calculated from calendar year of initial appointment):

- Assistant Professor/Librarian: 6<sup>th</sup> year
- Associate Professor/Librarian: 5<sup>th</sup> year
- Full Professor/Librarian: 4<sup>th</sup> year

Early tenure consideration:

- Assistant: from the 3<sup>rd</sup> year (Chair can initiate process in any year with candidate's consent)
- Associate/Full: any year



# Delaying consideration

- In the case of authorized leaves of longer than 3 months, staff may **elect** to exclude these as periods of service for tenure consideration. This has the effect of placing the candidate in the following year's tenure cohort.
- Candidates who so elect must inform the Provost's office in writing not later than June 1 of the normal year of tenure consideration.
- Only 2 such extensions permitted in total (including extensions relating to leaves taken before reappointment).



# Levels of Review

All committee members must be tenured:

- DTC – Departmental tenure committee, chaired by Department Chair, plus at least 4 others
- UTC – University tenure committee, chaired by Dean, plus 5 others
- Principal or delegate (Provost)



# Joint Appointments

- Where a staff member has a joint appointment, both departments shall be equally represented on the tenure committee.
- Chairs of the two departments shall agree on a chair of the committee.
- Where two faculties are involved, the deans shall agree on faculty representatives on UTC and who will chair the UTC.



# Criteria for Tenure

- Criteria for tenure are based on performance of academic duties.
- Within 2 months of the initial tenure track appointment, the Chair/Director shall communicate the unit's written criteria for reappointment and tenure to the staff member.



# Criteria: Academic Duties

## Professors

Academic duties (assigned by the Chair/  
Director of the academic unit):

- Teaching (e.g. undergraduate and graduate courses; supervision of students, etc.)
- Research and other original scholarly activities, and professional activities
- Other contributions to the University and scholarly communities ('Service')





# Criteria: Academic Duties

## **Librarians**

Academic duties (assigned by the Dean of Libraries):

- Position responsibilities, which require the exercise of professional expertise or practice;
- Professional and scholarly activities, which may include research;
- Other contributions to the University and scholarly communities ('Service').



# Criteria for Tenure

## Focus:

- Candidate's performance of academic duties

## Standard required:

- **Superior** performance in **two** categories
- **Reasonable** performance in the **third**

Note: for Librarians, a rating of **superior** in position responsibilities is required



# Criteria for Tenure

- Performance, not promise.
- The period being assessed includes all years up to the year of tenure consideration.
- Performance at McGill during tenure-track period, rather than before. (Exception: early tenure candidates.)
- Whole record during tenure-track period (all years and all duties).
- No overflow from one category to another.
- No double counting of achievements.



# Some Basic Responsibilities

Candidates must exercise due diligence in preparing and pursuing the case for tenure:

- Establishing they have met the requirements
- Assembling the parts of the dossier for which they are responsible

The dossier is something that can be worked on in advance – don't wait till the last minute!



# Dossier - Candidate

- Curriculum vitae
- Personal statement (outlining your performance of academic duties)
- ➔ Record of **research**, scholarship, professional activities and contributions (including examples of publications)
- ➔ Record of **teaching**  
(Teaching Portfolio Guidelines: *Regulations, Appendix A*)
- ➔ General **contributions to University & scholarly community**
- Other materials the Candidate may wish to submit



# Dossier - additional items

Additional items (added to tenure dossier after Sept 1st):

- External evaluator reports (added by the Secretariat)
- Items added by DTC Chair (pre-Nov. 15) (if any)
- Items added by Candidate (pre-Nov. 15) (if any)
- New material, if requested by DTC, UTC or the Principal (or delegate) to clarify an issue that has arisen during deliberations (post-Nov. 15)



# External Evaluators - tenure

- Provide an evaluation of the candidate's research and scholarship.
- Must be of recognized standing and qualified to provide an evaluation.
- Must not be in the employ of McGill University.
- Must not be in a conflict of interest with the candidate (e.g. supervisors, close personal relationships, recent colleagues or collaborators).



# Tenure Timetable

## Phase I

- **Prior to May 1:** Candidate and Chair agree on list of eight (8) external evaluators. Chair forwards list to Dean.
- **By June 1:** Candidates intending to make election to defer tenure consideration must have done so by this date.
- **By June 30:** UTC ranks list of external evaluators. Secretariat contacts externals over the summer.





# Tenure Timetable

- **By September 1:**
  - Candidate submits dossier to Secretary-General:
    - ▶ one internal package (on CD or memory stick)
    - ▶ one external package (=internal package minus the teaching) (on CD or memory stick)



# Tenure Timetable

## Phase II

**Sept-Jan DTC meets**

- **November 15**
  - Deadline for addition of material by DTC Chair
  - Deadline for submission by Candidate of additional material



# Tenure Timetable

- **Post November 15**

If requested by DTC, Candidate adds new material to dossier, to address issues that have arisen during consideration of the case.

- **November 25**

Secretary-General transmits external evaluators' reports to DTC and UTC.



# Tenure Timetable

## Phase III

**Jan – Apr UTC meets**

- **January 25**
  - Deadline for DTC to submit report.

UTC may seek further information from the candidate, the Department Chair or from one or more additional external evaluators.



# Tenure Timetable

- **April 30**
  - Deadline for UTC to submit report.
- **May-June**
  - Decision by the Principal/Provost and recommendation to the Board of Governors.
  - Principal/Provost, if tending to a negative, communicates decision to Candidate.



# Committee Recommendations

- Committees (DTC and UTC) must be guided by objectivity, impartiality and fairness.
- Recommendations to be based solely on performance of academic duties.
- Recommendations to be based on the record of the Candidate's case before the committee.
- Committees must provide substantive reasons to support assessment of Candidate's performance in all areas.



# Outcomes

- In cases where a committee, the Dean or the Provost is tending towards a negative decision at any point in the process for reappointment or for tenure, the candidate must be:
  - advised in writing, with concerns/reasons;
  - given access to the substance of external evaluators' reports;
  - given reasonable time to prepare a response
  - given opportunity to address the concerns in person;
  - allowed an advisor (member of the University community).



# Outcomes

- In the event that a candidate is not recommended for reappointment or tenure:
  - Appointment may continue for up to one year, if at least 37 weeks prior notice has not been given.
  - The candidate may file an appeal.





# Outcomes

- Most of you will NOT face a 'tending to the negative' situation.
- Even if you do, it is important to understand that candidates not only have the opportunity to address the committee's concerns but that in many cases they are successful in convincing the committee that a positive recommendation is appropriate.



# Outcomes

- If tenure is granted, the staff member will be appointed to an indefinite term appointment, starting on June 1st.



# Who to ask

- If you need help in interpreting any aspect of the Regulations relating to tenure, feel free to email me: [lydia.white@mcgill.ca](mailto:lydia.white@mcgill.ca).
- If you have questions concerning timing of tenure, contact APO: [academic.personnel@mcgill.ca](mailto:academic.personnel@mcgill.ca).
- If you have questions concerning tenure submission deadlines or procedures, contact the Secretariat: [bonnie.borenstein@mcgill.ca](mailto:bonnie.borenstein@mcgill.ca).
- FAQ on tenure: <http://www.mcgill.ca/apo/deans-and-chairs-guide/promotion-tenure>



# Conclusion

- The reappointment and tenure processes may seem intimidating but don't be intimidated!
- You can make the process easier for yourselves by planning ahead.
- Don't be afraid to ask for advice, both within your department and outside.
- Don't wait till the last minute to put your dossier together.